

PROJECT NO. 5138-24 – SHEARN RESIDENCE – 633 E. MAPLE AVENUE

JUSTIFICATION LETTER

STAFF COMMENT

The proposed fence with pilasters and 6' high CMU BBQ wall are not recommended, per Standard for Rehabilitation #3 for "creating a false sense of history" (<https://www.cityoforange.org/home/showpublisheddocument/68/637698075152800000>). Staff recommendation is to eliminate the proposed pilasters/BBQ wall and keep the simple wood fence design.

KEY GUIDELINES

Standard for Rehabilitation #3: "Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken."

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.

JUSTIFICATION

COMPATIBLE USE

We are proposing adding a use to the rear landscape—an outdoor kitchen with an arbor-covered access gate. The horizontal configuration of the space necessitates locating the grill/prep counter in the location shown in the landscape plan. Wood fencing would be an inappropriate material to use for this application. The wood trellis over the kitchen provides some additional shade, creates a unique differentiation of the space, and provides human scale by creating a partial ceiling.

We are also proposing a mechanized gate across the driveway. The masonry pilaster at the hinge side of the gate provides a sturdy point of attachment for the heavy gate and provides a substantial point of transition between the taller fence and the lower fence. It also ties into the materials at the kitchen/arbor. Standards for rehabilitation allow compatible uses on the condition that they do not "create a false sense of historical development."

AVOIDING CREATING A FALSE SENSE OF HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT

Adding non-historical elements to a historic building without creating a false sense of history or being conjectural involves a few key principles:

Compatibility: Ensure that new additions are compatible with the historic character of the building. This means using materials, scale, and design elements that harmonize with the original structure.

The design of the pilasters, fence, gate, and trellis pulls inspiration from the historic home. The pilasters and trellis are direct nods to the original home's pilasters and trellis. The stucco finish will closely match the finish of the existing foundation wall at the rear of the house (not visible from the street). Additionally, the wall pilaster, trellis, and stucco finish are references to similar design elements in the neighborhood and of the era and architectural style. The house kitty-corner to ours at 704 E Maple has a similar design with brick pilasters, vine-covered wall, trellis, and a transition from a tall fence to a low fence at the alley corner cutoff. Stucco-covered masonry pilasters are common throughout Old Towne and are common to the era and architectural style.

Differentiation: While new elements should be compatible, they should also be distinguishable from the historic fabric.

The design achieves this in a few ways, first the kitchen structure is separated from the home by 5'. Second, the trellis beam and purlin end details are subordinate in detail to the original trellis. Thirdly, the wall and pilasters use a different material than the original stone porch wall and pilasters. Lastly, the scale of the structure is subordinate to the original columns and trellis.

Preservation of Significant Features: Preserve significant historic materials, features, and forms. Avoid removing or altering character-defining elements of the historic building.

The original garage was moved and modified in the 1940's and the original perimeter barrier was long ago demolished leaving nothing to preserve in that regard.

Documentation and Reversibility: Document the changes made and ensure that new additions can be reversed in the future if needed.

Changes are being thoroughly documented through this process and the changes are not tied into the historic structure. Future demolition will not disturb original features.

RELEVANT REFERENCE INFORMATION

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the treatment of Historic Properties: rehabilitation as a treatment and standards for rehabilitation

#9 "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment."

#10 "New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

REFERENCE IMAGES



154 N Harwood
Stucco masonry pilasters



206 Pine St
Solid wall with pilasters



704 E Maple (kitty-corner)
Brick pilasters and arbor



159 N Shaffer St
Solid wall with pilasters



227 N Shaffer St
Brick wall, pilasters, and arbor



205 Pine St
Solid wall with pilasters



295 N Batavia
Masonry pilasters and wood arbor