



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 4.1.

11/3/2021

File #: 21-0588

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director
FROM: Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner - Historic Preservation

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5051-21, North Olive Residences, 457-463 N. Olive Street

2. SUMMARY

Final determination by the Design Review Committee.

The applicant proposes an exterior renovation to two existing multi-family residential buildings. The property is a non-contributing resource within the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner:	Seaview Company
Property Location:	457-463 N. Olive Street
General Plan Designation:	Low Density Residential (LDR)
Zoning Classification:	Duplex Residential (R-2-6)
Existing Development:	Four unit multi-family complex consisting of a single-story building and a two-story building totaling 3,093 square feet and a 800 square foot attached garage
Associated Application:	Accessory Dwelling Unit No. 0066-21
Previous DRC Project Review:	None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes an exterior renovation to two existing multi-family residential buildings. Design details of the project include:

- Add new decorative gables to existing hip roof on both buildings.
- Add new wood board and batten siding to the street-facing elevations of both buildings.
- Replace existing windows with new fiberglass clad wood windows with exterior applied muntin bars.
- Install new solid core wood entry doors for all units.

- Demolish the existing cast concrete and steel staircase and construct a new wood frame and plaster staircase for the rear two-story building.

The project meets all of the development standards for the R-2-6 zoning district. A separate application for creation of an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) within the existing attached garage of the rear building is currently under review by Planning staff. Details of the location and floor plan are provided for reference only.

5. EXISTING SITE

The project site is a four-plex residential development constructed in 1966. There are two dwelling units in the front single-story building and two dwelling units in the rear two-story building, with attached garages in both buildings.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The property is located mid-block on the east side of N. Olive Street between W. Sycamore Avenue and W. Walnut Avenue. The block is within the boundaries of the Old Towne Historic District and within the historic Cypress Street Barrio neighborhood. Surrounding properties represent a mix of single and multi-family residential, with the project site one of three similar four-plex properties in a row on the same side of the street.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Staff has not identified any issue items for this project. Overall, the proposed project complies with the standards for non-historic buildings within the Old Towne Historic District. The proposed exterior renovation adds new design elements, including roof gables and board and batten siding, which are compatible with the existing form of the buildings and reference the mid-century date of construction of the property. No additions are proposed to either building, therefore the mass and scale of the existing development will not increase or have any additional impact on the scale of development along N. Olive Street.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemptions: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15301 (Class 1 - Existing Facilities) because the project consists of alterations to an existing multi-family property with no expansions to building size.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from four sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)
- Orange Eichler Design Standards (or OEDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and

statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

- *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.G.1).*

The project as proposed conforms to the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. No additions are proposed to the buildings that would increase the mass and scale of the existing development. Materials and finishes proposed for the exterior renovation are allowable for non-historic properties within the historic district. Furthermore, the simple architectural design is compatible with the existing buildings and does not compete with or diminish the architectural importance of the contributing historic properties on N. Olive Street.

- *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.G.2).*

The subject property is not a contributing resource to the National Register-listed Old Towne Historic District. However, the property is adjacent to historic properties and therefore was evaluated based on its potential to affect the setting of the streetscape along N. Olive Street.

The proposed project does not adversely impact the integrity of the historic character of the Old Towne Historic District. The project maintains the existing development pattern of the site as no additions are proposed to either existing building. Building improvements are within a similar palette of materials, mass and scale of adjacent development. The simple architectural design of the exterior renovation is compatible with the existing buildings and does not compete with or diminish the architectural importance of the contributing historic properties on N. Olive Street.

- *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.G.3).*

The proposed project complies with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The design of the exterior renovation is a contemporary application of design features used during the mid-century period when the project site was developed and complement the existing architecture of the buildings. Furthermore, materials and finishes proposed are allowable for non-historic properties within the historic district and will not detract from the historic setting of the neighborhood.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included as Attachment 3 (date stamped September 29, 2021) of this report, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
4. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
6. If not utilized, project approval expires 24 months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 - Letter of Explanation
- Attachment 3 - Architectural Plans date stamped 9/29/2021
- Attachment 4 - DPR Form for 457-463 N. Olive Street
- Attachment 5 - Window Product Specifications