



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 4.1.

11/6/2024

File #: 24-0549

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Chad Ortlieb, Principal Planner

FROM: Ryan Agbayani, Associate Planner

1. SUBJECT

A request to modify an existing historic single-family dwelling and detached garage and construct a new detached accessory structure in the Old Town Historic District at 633 E. Maple Avenue (Design Review No. 5138).

2. SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to:

1. Remodel the previously altered kitchen and rear utility space of the existing historic single-family residence
2. Modify the existing detached garage
3. Construct a new detached garage/workshop, and
4. Perform related site improvements including hardscape, landscape, and relocation of the driveway.

3. RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approval by the Design Review Committee with staff recommended conditions.

4. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Stephen H. Shearn

Property Location: 633 E. Maple Avenue

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Residential Single-Family 6,000 sq ft (R-1-6)

Existing Development: Two-story single-family dwelling with detached garage and detached accessory sheds

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

5. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to modify the existing dwelling and detached garage and construct a new detached accessory structure at the rear. The major components of the project include:

Existing Two-Story Dwelling

- Remodel the previously altered first-floor kitchen and rear utility space at the northwest corner of the residence
- Replace the existing shed roof at the rear addition with a new gable roof
- Construct a new wood framed rear deck area surrounded by a low CMU wall with stone veneer to match the existing dwelling and concrete cap
- Install poured-in-place concrete steps to access the wood framed deck
- Install CMU pilasters with stone veneer to match the existing dwelling and concrete cap flanking the concrete steps at the rear deck area

Existing Detached Garage

- Remove the existing garage door at the south façade and replace with a new swinging double garage door
- Install a new swinging double garage door at the north façade to create drive-thru access
- Replace the existing vinyl window at the east façade with a new double-hung wood window
- Remove the existing single man door at the western façade and install new wood divided lite double doors

New Detached Accessory Garage/Workshop at Rear

- Construct a new detached garage/workshop (458 sq ft) at northwest corner of the site with a swinging double garage door at the east façade

Related Site Improvements

- Remove the existing driveway apron fronting on N. Harwood Street located between the dwelling and detached garage, and relocate to the north of the detached garage
- Install a 6-foot-tall wooden fence along eastern property line fronting on N. Harwood Street, between the right-side entry gate pilaster to the driveway
- Install five 6-foot-tall CMU pilasters with exterior plaster finish and concrete cap along the eastern property line fronting on N. Harwood Street
- Install 6-foot-tall CMU walls with exterior plaster finish, overhead arbor, and built-in barbeque in the area located northeast of the single-family dwelling
- Install brick paving at the side gate entrance visible from N. Harwood Street

6. EXISTING SITE

The existing 0.275-acre site is currently developed with a two-story 1,895 sq ft Craftsman-style home. Character defining features include:

- A dominant, moderate- to high-pitched, side-gabled roof with front and rear shed-roofed dormers, wide gable eaves with exposed, tapered rafters and wide gable ends supported by knee braces
- Wide clapboard siding
- Wood-framed, mostly double-hung windows with original wood screens
- A deeply recessed, full-width porch and original front door
- Matching river rock stone in the foundation walls, porch walls, and columns with an integrated side porte cochere, and interior chimney
- An existing detached garage located to the north of the dwelling
- Multiple existing detached shed structures at the rear of the property.

7. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The property is located at the northwest corner of the intersection of E. Maple Avenue and N. Harwood Street. The existing zoning designation of the subject property and all surrounding properties is R-1-6. The dwellings to the north and east are designated as contributors; however, the dwellings to the south and west are non-contributors.

The applicant prepared a separate Floor Area Ratio (FAR) analysis of the 600 block of E. Maple Avenue as shown on Sheet A-1 of the project plans. A summary is included below:

	Including Non-Contributing Residences	Excluding Non-Contributing Residences
Average Existing FAR	0.272 FAR (Range: 0.18 to 0.44 FAR)	0.255 FAR (Range: 0.18 to 0.35 FAR)
Average Proposed FAR (with the new detached structure)	0.276 FAR (Range: 0.22 to 0.44 FAR)	0.261 FAR (Range: 0.22 to 0.35 FAR)

8. PROJECT ANALYSIS

Proposed Fence with CMU Pilasters, 6-Foot-High CMU BBQ Walls, and Overhead Arbor:

The applicant is proposing a wood fence with CMU pilasters and six-foot-high CMU walls with exterior plaster finish along the eastern property line fronting on N. Harwood Street. An arbor is proposed attached above the wall. The area behind the wall is intended for a built-in barbecue. The applicant has prepared a narrative to justify how the proposed CMU barbecue walls and pilasters meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (see Attachment 3). However, staff's recommendation is that the proposed perimeter fencing be modified to maintain the simple wood fence design. Staff is referencing Standard for Rehabilitation #3, which states that, "Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as addition conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken." The goal of Standard #3 is to retain the sequence of historical development.

The proposed arbor does not meet the dimension requirements of Orange Municipal Code Section 17.12.040D.11. Arbors are limited to an eight-foot height, four-foot width, and two foot depth. Therefore, Condition No. 9 is included to require the applicant to eliminate the exterior CMU walls, pilasters with plaster finish, concrete cap, and arbor. The fence is to be reverted to a simple wood

fence design. With this condition, staff can support approval of the project.

With the arbor, staff is unable to recommend project approval and the DRC may not approve the project with the arbor because it does not comply with code.

Brick Paving at Side Gate Entrance along Eastern Property Line:

The applicant is proposing brick paving in a major area of the internal private yard area and along the western portion of the primary home. Staff does not regulate paving on private property that is not visible from the public right-of-way. However, there is a small area of brick paving at the side gate entrance along the eastern property line that will be visible from the right-of-way. Brick is not typically a material used in Old Towne. Staff does not support the proposed brick paving that is visible in front of the gate entrance.

Staff recommends Condition No. 10 to require the applicant propose an appropriate alternate paving material in the area in front of the side gate that is visible from the public right-of-way. With this condition, staff can support approval of the project.

9. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

10. PUBLIC NOTICE

On October 24, 2024, public notices were mailed to a total of 94 property owners and occupants within a 400-foot radius of the project site. Two public notices were posted at the site on that same date.

11. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 (Class 32 - In-Fill Development Projects) because the project is consistent with the applicable General Plan designation and all applicable General Plan policies as well as with the applicable zoning designation and regulations, the proposed development occurs within city limits on a project site of no more than five acres substantially surrounded by urban uses, the project site has no value as a habitat for endangered, rare, or threatened species, approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality, and the site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

12. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC make a final determination on the proposed project with recommended conditions (Orange Municipal Code 17.10.070.G).

1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project.

The proposed modifications to the kitchen and rear utility area of the existing home and to the existing detached garage seem appropriate, given the removal of inappropriate mismatched windows and installation of new uniformly sized double hung wood windows. The proposed change from a shed roof to a gable roof at the rear is compatible with the gable roof of the existing detached garage and new detached garage/workshop. However, meeting the finding is contingent on Condition No. 9 requiring the proposed fence be modified to eliminate the

plaster-finished CMU pilasters, CMU BBQ walls, arbor, and revert the fence to a simple wood fence design. Additionally, brick is not typically a material used in Old Towne. Staff does not support a brick paving that is visible in front of the gate entrance. Condition No. 10 requires an appropriate alternate paving material in the area in front of the side gate that is visible from the public right-of-way. With the conditions, the project will conform to prescriptive standards and design criteria.

2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines.

The proposed modifications to the kitchen and rear utility area of the existing home and to the existing detached garage are appropriate, given the removal of inappropriate mismatched windows and installation of new uniformly sized double hung wood windows. The proposed change from a shed roof to a gable roof at the rear is compatible with the gable roof of the existing detached garage and new detached garage/workshop. This finding can be made with implementation of Conditions No. 9 and 10 to:

- a. Modify the fence to eliminate the plaster-finished CMU pilasters
 - b. Eliminate CMU BBQ walls
 - c. Eliminate the arbor
 - d. Maintain the simple wood fence design
 - e. Eliminate brick paving from the front of the gate entrance.
3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings.

The proposed modifications to the kitchen and rear utility area incorporate a design that is consistent and integrated with the existing dwelling with the installation of compatible double hung windows. Furthermore, the new gable roof is consistent with gable roofs of the existing detached garage and the new detached garage/workshop.

4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character.

The proposed modifications to the kitchen and rear utility area of the existing home are not located on a primary elevation that directly interfaces with the street. Additionally, the proposed detached garage/workshop is set back roughly 80 feet from the eastern property line and has a maximum height of 10 feet, 9 inches. As such, the bulk, mass, and scale of the existing development is not altered with the proposed modifications.

13. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

General:

1. All construction shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans and exhibits included in the staff report dated November 6, 2024, including any modifications required by conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approved action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan administratively.
3. Subsequent modifications to the approved architecture or color scheme shall be submitted for review and approval to the Community Development Director or designee. Should the modifications be considered substantial, the modifications shall be reviewed by the Design Review Committee (at a subsequent public hearing).
4. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall provide a structural condition assessment and bracing plan, specifically for the existing detached garage. The assessment shall verify that the existing garage can accommodate the modifications, including the new swinging double doors.

Lighting:

5. Any new lighting on the premise shall be installed in such a way to direct, control, and screen the lighting to prevent off-site light spillage onto adjoining properties and shall not be a nuisance to any point beyond the exterior boundaries of the property.

Landscaping:

6. Prior to building permit issuance, final landscaping plans for the project shall be designed to comply with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Guidelines as described in Section IX et al of the City of Orange Landscape Standards and Specifications.
7. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall prepare and final landscaping and irrigation plan consistent with the site plan, grading plans, and the conceptual landscaping plan as proposed for the new project for the review and approval by the Community Development Director or designee.
8. Landscape maintenance shall be performed in such a manner as to allow all trees to retain their full canopy height for screening and full canopy breadth for shade at point of maturity, except as required for public safety purposes.

Staff Recommended Conditions:

9. The applicant shall eliminate the exterior CMU walls, pilasters with plaster finish, concrete cap, and arbor. The fence shall be reverted to the existing simple wood fence design.
10. The applicant shall eliminate the brick paving proposed at the side gate entrance and propose an appropriate alternate paving material in the portion that is visible from the

public right-of-way.

14. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 - Project Plans
- Attachment 3 - Applicant's Justification for Proposed CMU Walls and Pilasters
- Attachment 4 - Digital Color and Materials Board
- Attachment 5 - JELD-WEN Siteline Window Details
- Attachment 6 - Cultural Resources Memo Report Dated February 18, 2024
- Attachment 7 - Site Photos
- Attachment 8 - DPR Survey Form
- Attachment 9 - Development Standards Reference Table