



AGENDA ITEM

DESIGN REVIEW

April 15, 2020

TO: William R. Crouch, AICP, AIA, NCARB, LEED (AP), Community Development Director

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Chad Ortlieb, Senior Planner

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5008-20, Fire Station No. 1, 105 and 180 S. Water Street

2. SUMMARY

The City of Orange is proposing a new 16,574 square foot Fire Station No. 1 building, an attached 11,353 square foot Fire Headquarters office, an associated parking lot across the street at 180 S. Water Street, and to utilize an existing 3,780 on-site building, currently used by the Water Division, for reserve apparatus.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant: City of Orange

Owner: City of Orange

Property Location: 105 and 180 S. Water Street

General Plan Designation: Public Facilities Max. 0.5 FAR and Institutions Max 2.0 FAR (PFI) and Low Density Residential 2-6 du/ac (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Office Professional (O-P) and Single Family Residential 6,000 sq. ft. (R-1-6)

Existing Development: Vacant land and an existing 3,780 on-site building, currently used by the Water Division

Associated Application: Zone Change No. 1301-20 and Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 1862-18

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The City will be constructing a new Fire Station No. 1 and headquarters administration building at 105 S. Water Street. Combined, the total building area is 27,927 square feet. The project also includes the construction of a parking lot at 180 S. Water Street and the

repurposing of an existing 3,780 square foot storage building currently used by the Water Division for the storage of Fire Department apparatus.

Fire Station No. 1 and Headquarters Building -105 S. Water Street

The building is configured with a “H” shaped footprint with hollows of the “H” accommodating the Apparatus room and apparatus entry and exiting to the site. The east side (Water Street-facing) of the “H” contains a single-story wing of rooms for the on duty responder fire crew and the west side (Jameson Street-facing) contains the headquarters offices in a two-story configuration. The response driveway for the apparatus exits north onto Chapman Avenue and the return driveway, visitor parking, and staff parking lot is behind the building to the south.

The building provides undulation, consistent hip roof usage with a flat roof for the apparatus bay, stepbacks for second story features, coherently alternating colors and materials, and architectural details such as:

- Grooved stucco walls
- Red accordion apparatus bay doors
- Brick veneer façade with horizontal grooves on the apparatus bay building and tower entry feature
- Concrete Spanish tile-style roofing material
- Charcoal-colored window and door trim
- Cornice treatment over the flat roof of the apparatus bay section
- Mildly arching stone-like veneer over apparatus bays
- Ample window placement in appropriately regularly-spaced configuration
- Faux-window or vent accents placed in voids in the wall planes

The parking lot south of Fire Station No. 1 contains 5 visitor parking spaces outside of a security gate and 21 staff parking spaces inside the gated parking area. The gate type is unspecified. Inside the staff parking area is an enclosure for a generator and fuel tank and another enclosure for mechanical equipment. The enclosure type is unspecified.

The site perimeter is landscaped with trees and shrubs at appropriately regularly-spaced intervals. Trees include Magnolias at the Chapman Avenue-facing frontage, Goldenrain trees facing Water and Jameson Streets, and Brisbane Box trees between the site and southern boundary where the water yard begins. Shrubs include a variety mixed with accent plantings and groundcover as specified on the landscape plan.

Site lighting and photometrics are not available at this design stage.

Parking Lot – 180 S. Water Street

The parking lot contains 54 staff parking spaces behind a fenced perimeter with a sliding access gate onto Water Street. Two guest parking spaces are located outside the gate. A second sliding gate is provided to the contiguous but undeveloped City property to the west that is not being developed as part of this project. The fence and gate type is unspecified. The parking lot perimeter and islands within it are landscaped with trees and shrubs at appropriate regularly-spaced intervals and with the same types as planted for the Fire Station No. 1 building. The exception being that Jacaranda trees will be planted

within the parking lot. Parking lot lighting and photometrics are not available at this design stage.

Storage Building

The existing storage building south of Fire Station No.1 is sheet metal-clad with roll up doors facing Water Street. The building is proposed to be repurposed for use in storing Fire Department apparatus. It is anticipated that the building will be structurally reinforced, re-clad with sheet metal, and fitted with new automatic bay doors. The sheet metal, doors, and color of the building is not yet decided at this time.

5. EXISTING SITE

The sites are vacant and unimproved except for an existing block wall at property line facing Chapman Avenue, temporary perimeter chain-link along the property lines facing Jameson and Water Streets, and the metal storage building.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The area is the eastern gateway to Old Towne but is not in the Historic Overlay district. The surroundings are as follows:

	Zoning	Surrounding Use
North	Office Professional (O-P)	East Chapman Avenue and single-story office buildings and residences
South	Office Professional (O-P) and Single Family Residential (R-1-6)	South Jameson Street and single-story residences, some which may be eligible for future consideration as an Individually Significant Historic Building
East	Public Institution (P-I)	City of Orange Water Division Yard with a building which may be eligible for future consideration as an Individually Significant Historic Building
West	Office Professional (O-P) and, Single Family Residential (R-1-6)	South Water Street and the proposed parking lot and a two-story office building.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Staff thinks that the overall design approach is appropriate for the site and surrounding context, and that the design element provides for building articulation and materials that reference historic residential forms and materials along Chapman. The massing of the project is also sensitive to the surrounding residential neighborhoods. The project continues to have opportunities for design enhancement and refinement at this phase. Continued coordination by Public Works with the Community Development department is recommended for the following project components:

1. Details on perimeter fencing should be provided for review. Tube steel fencing matching the fencing at the Water Yard is recommended.
2. A lighting configuration plan and photometric plan should be provided for review to verify needs of site security and prevention of off-site intensity and glare.

3. Details of the generator and mechanical equipment enclosure should be provided to show the height, enclosure material, and nature of the equipment inside.
4. The first horizontal joint shown upward from the base of Fire Station No. 1 should implement a differing paint color as was designed on the Main Library. Physical paint samples should be provided for the whole of the building.
5. The brick veneer and roofing material for the Fire Station No. 1 as shown on the plan exhibits have differing reddish hues. Physical material samples with hue-matching characteristics should be provided for acceptance by the Community Development Department prior to material purchase.
6. The use of Jacaranda trees in the parking area could result in sticky flower deposits on staff and visitor vehicles. The selection of an alternate tree and the review of the landscape and irrigation plans, as they are refined, should be coordinated with the City's Senior Landscape Coordinator.
7. As plans develop, the metal siding, doors, and paint color for the repurposed storage building should be reviewed by the Community Development Department.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

Streamlined Multi-Disciplined Accelerated Review Team (SMART) review occurred on February 19, 2020, and comments were transmitted to the project manager. The City is supportive of the project as it is adaptively refined to reach final plan development. No further SMART review will occur.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

No public notice is required for Design Review.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 1862-18 is being prepared for the project.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

Findings for DRC applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code (OMC)
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)
- The Orange Eichler Design Standards

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Finding and statement in support of such Finding, staff recommends the DRC approve the focused project refinement subject to recommended conditions.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).

The project is respectful of the area community aesthetics and sensitive to the gateway corridor to Old Towne in that it utilizes architectural elements appropriate to a fire station and headquarters office. Several of the building materials are characteristic of corridor buildings including the use of plaster walls, brick façade, hip roof forms, and architectural detailing. The height of the building is minimized to that needed to support apparatus bays and crew occupancy, and office needs. The second story component is stepped back from the first story level and a public entry point is focused under a tower feature. The building provides architectural interest via indentations in architectural plane. Architectural elements are alternated and intertwined. Windows are regularly-spaced. Landscaping is provided around the perimeter of the sites and includes an adequate setback with trees that soften views to the building and parking lots. The building is sited between three streets which further reduces any impacts of mass to adjacent properties. Repurposing of the existing storage building will ensure that no greater visual mass will occur than exists for that building now and planned improvements would enhance the appearance.

The issues identified in the staff report will be resolved through a cooperative working relationship among the Public Works Department and applicable City Departments.

There is no specific plan or applicable design standards applicable to this property.

12. CONDITIONS

The City, as a regulating authority, does not seek to condition its own projects. However, the seven issue items listed within this staff report are the considerations upon which this project is evaluated by the Community Development Department. Public Works staff has agreed the issues should be addressed to improve the project and meet the mutual goal of all City Departments to further project completion with appropriate design.

13. ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity map
2. Project Plans