



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 4.2.

11/6/2024

File #: 24-0569

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Chad Ortlieb, Principal Planner

FROM: Ryan Agbayani, Associate Planner

1. SUBJECT

A request to construct a rear addition and partial interior remodel of an existing Bungalow-style single-family dwelling in the Old Towne Orange Historic District at 247 N. Center Street (Design Review No. 5143).

2. SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to construct a rear addition and partial interior remodel of an existing one-story single-family dwelling located in the Old Towne Orange Historic District.

3. RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approval by the Design Review Committee.

4. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Property Owner: Daniel and Kimberly Healy

Applicant: John DiLauro (Studio D)

Property Location: 247 N. Center Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Single-Family Residential 6,000 Sq Ft (R-1-6)

Existing Development: Existing Single-Family Dwelling with Detached Garage

Associated Application: Mills Act Contract (pending)

Previous DRC Project Review: None

5. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to construct a new 267 sq ft addition at the rear of the existing dwelling, as well as an interior remodel to a 148 sq ft portion of the existing dwelling to create a new master bedroom suite. The existing double-hung wood window and exterior wood door at the rear (east elevation) will be removed for the addition. The new compatible awning and double-hung wood windows will be installed in the new addition area. A new wood stile and rail sliding door will be installed at the rear elevation for exterior access to a raised wood porch with steps leading to the backyard. Lastly, a new 216 sq ft open trellis patio cover will be constructed at the rear.

6. EXISTING SITE

The 6,750 sq ft site is currently developed with a one-story Bungalow-style single-family dwelling, detached garage, and detached shed at the rear. The dwelling was originally constructed in 1919, and is designated as a contributor to the Old Towne Orange Historic District. Access to the detached garage is from a shared driveway with the property to the south.

7. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject site is located in the northeast quadrant of the Old Town Orange Historic District, on the east side of N. Center Street, with E. Palm Avenue to the north and E. Maple Avenue to the south. To the immediate north is a duplex consisting of two one-story structures. To the immediate south is a one-story single-family dwelling with detached garage. To the immediate west is an existing two-story single-family dwelling with attached garage. To the immediate east is an existing one-story single-family dwelling with attached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). The zoning designation for the area is Single-Family Residential 6,000 sq ft (R-1-6). The dwellings to the south and east are designated as contributors; however, the dwellings to the north and west are designated as non-contributors.

8. PROJECT ANALYSIS

Issue 1 Differentiation of Addition:

The Historic Preservation Design Standards (HPDS) allow for additions to residential dwellings that retain the character defining features of the building and comply with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. The applicant is proposing to construct a new 267 sq ft addition at the rear of the property to create a new master bedroom suite. The addition requires the removal of the existing lap siding, an exterior door, and a window at the rear. A new wood stile and rail sliding door will be installed on the east elevation of the addition facing the rear. There will be a clear and distinct offset in the wall plane between the existing dwelling and new addition area, which will distinguish the old from new construction. Additional demarcation between the original house and addition is provided through the implementation of 6-inch to 7-inch exposure horizontal lap siding on the new addition, versus the current 3-inch to 3-inch to 7-inch exposure horizontal lap siding on the existing dwelling. At the two corner joints, there will be a ¾-inch by ¾-inch trim where the new siding meets existing. Lastly, the ridge of the hallway addition and new master bedroom will be offset to establish further distinction.

Staff believes that the proposed addition meets the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Standards for compatibility and differentiation from the original floor plan of the residence. Design features include the incorporation of wall offset, siding dimensions, and lowered roof height to provide sufficient evidence that the addition is not original to the home.

Issue 2 Visibility of Addition:

Additions should be configured in a way that respects the established pattern of the existing streetscape and front yard setbacks. Rear additions should be set back from the front façade of the house to minimize visibility from the street. The proposed rear addition is set back roughly 70 feet from the front property line and will not be easily visible from the street. Furthermore, the existing fencing will create further screening.

Staff supports the project as presented by the applicant. The HPDS emphasize preservation of the character-defining features of the front elevation of the residence which the project accomplishes by limiting appropriate modification to the rear elevation. The dwelling retains the overall form, appearance, and character of the original home.

9. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

10. PUBLIC NOTICE

On October 24, 2024, public notices were mailed to property owners and occupants within a 400-foot radius of the project site. A public notice was also posted at the site on that same date.

11. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 (Class 1 - Existing Facilities) because the project consists of an addition to an existing single-family dwelling that does not result in an increase of more than 50 percent of the floor area before the addition, the project site is located in an area where all public services and facilities are available, and the area in which the project is located is not environmentally sensitive.

12. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions (OMC 17.10.070.G).

1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project.

The project complies with the HPDS. The addition is located at the rear of the existing residence and not easily visible from N. Center Street, and is compatible in form, scale, and design with the architectural vocabulary of the existing Bungalow-style dwelling. The new addition has a maximum building height of 11 feet, 9 inches, which is subordinate to the building height of the dwelling. Differentiation between the original home and the new addition is achieved through incorporation of wall offset, exterior siding dimensions, and roof height.

2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines.

The project complies with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, specifically *Standards #9 and #10*. The proposed new construction is of an appropriate mass and scale, so as to be compatible with the property on which it is being built. The character of the design is also compatible, while also being differentiated from the original massing of the building through the incorporation of wall offset, exterior siding dimensions, and lower roof height. Though the new addition is attached to the existing dwelling, there is clear and distinct demarcation which would allow the original footprint to be restored, should the addition be demolished in the future.

3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings.

The project conforms to the prescriptive standards set forth in the HPDS and the OMC. The proposed addition is of compatible scale, style, and material with the existing dwelling and will match aesthetically with the overall design of the property.

4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design

Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character.

The Infill Residential Design Guidelines are not applicable to properties within the Old Towne Orange Historic District.

13. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included in the Design Review Committee staff report dated November 6, 2024, and in the project case file), including any modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees, as a condition of City's approval of Design Review No. 5143, to indemnify, defend, and hold harmless, at the applicant's expense, the City, its officers, agents, and employees ("City") from and against any claim, action, or proceeding brought against the City, including, but not limited to, any claim, action, or proceeding commenced within the time period provided in Government Code Section 66499.37 to attack, review, set aside, void, or annul the City's approval, to challenge the determination made by the City under the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") or to challenge the reasonableness, legality, or validity of any condition attached hereto. City shall promptly notify applicant of any such claim, action, or proceeding to which the City receives notice and to cooperate fully with the applicant in the defense thereof. Application shall reimburse the City for any and all costs and expenses, including, but not limited to, court costs and attorney's fees that the City may be required to pay, including any expenses ordered by a court or expenses incurred through the Office of the City Attorney in conjunction with said claim, action, or proceeding. City may, in its sole discretion, participate in the defense of any claim, action, or proceeding, but such participation shall not relieve applicant of the obligations of this condition. In the event that the applicant is required to defend City in connection with such claim, action, or proceeding, City shall have right to approve counsel to so defend the City, approval all significant decisions concerning the manner in which the defense is conducted and approve any and all settlements, which approval(s) shall not be unreasonably withheld. The obligations set forth herein remain in full force and effect throughout all stages of litigation including any and all appeals of any lower court judgement rendered in the proceeding. Further, applicant agrees to indemnify, defend, and hold harmless the City for all costs and expenses incurred in enforcing this provision.
4. The applicant shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, including all City regulations. Violation of any of those laws in connection with the use may be cause for revocation of this permit.

5. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on a dedicated sheet (or sheets) of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
6. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
7. Design Review No. 5143 shall become void if not vested within two years from the date of approval. Time extensions may be granted for up to one year, pursuant to OMC Section 17.08.060.

14. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 - Applicant's Project Narrative Letter
- Attachment 3 - Project Plans
- Attachment 4 - DPR Form
- Attachment 5 - Window and Door Product Brochure
- Attachment 6 - Development Standards Reference Table