



Agenda Item

Planning Commission

Item #: 4.2.

10/7/2024

File #: 24-0587

TO: Chair and Members of the Planning Commission

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Arlen Beck, Associate Planner

1. SUBJECT

Public Hearing to consider a request for a two-story, 12,190 sq ft addition to the existing dealership building, associated site improvements, and deviation of loading zone standards at 1400 N. Tustin Street, and finding of CEQA exemption (Conditional Use Permit No. 3206, Major Site Plan Review No. 1148, and Design Review No. 5126).

2. SUMMARY

The applicant proposes a two-story, 12,190 sq ft addition to an existing car dealership building for additional offices and file storage. The project also includes revised site circulation, a new security kiosk, additional vehicle storage, the addition of new shade canopies for customer waiting areas, and a dedicated new car delivery area.

3. RECOMMENDED ACTION

1. Adopt Planning Commission Resolution No. 26-24. A Resolution of the Planning Commission approving Conditional Use Permit No. 3206, Major Site Plan Review No. 1148, and Design Review No. 5126 for a two-story, 12,190 sq ft addition, associated site improvements, and deviation of loading zone standards, for an existing automotive dealership located at 1400 N. Tustin Street.
2. Find the proposal exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15332.

4. AUTHORIZING GUIDELINES

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.08.020 B.2.a. authorizes the Planning Commission to review and take final action on applications for Conditional Use Permits, Major Site Plans, and Design Review. Footnote (b) of Table 17.08.020 of the OMC - Reviewing Bodies - states that when more than one type of application is filed for a single project, the application requiring the highest level of approval shall dictate the review process for the entire group of applications. The Planning Commission is the highest level approving body for these applications.

5. PROJECT BACKGROUND

<i>Applicant:</i>	Casey Griffin
<i>Property Owner:</i>	Wilson Automotive

<i>Property Location:</i>	1400 N. Tustin Steet
<i>Specific Plan/PC:</i>	The project is located within Tustin Street Design Standards, Thematic District 4
<i>Existing General Plan Land Use Element Designation:</i>	General Commercial, Max 1.0 FAR (GC)
<i>Existing Zoning Classification:</i>	Limited Business-Tustin Redevelopment Project Area (C-TR)
<i>Site Size:</i>	180,880 sq ft (4.15 acres)
<i>Circulation:</i>	The subject site is located on the west side of N. Tustin Street. There are three entrances from N. Tustin Street to access the project site. There is an access point from N. Tustin Street at the south end of the site that leads to a small parking lot. The main access is taken at the intersection of N. Tustin Street and Toyota Way. There is an additional access point from N. Tustin Street at the north end of the site. This project will add access from E. Trenton Avenue for emergency responder use only. Tustin Street is designated as a major arterial based on the General Plan.
<i>Existing Conditions:</i>	The project site is 4.15 acres and consists of eight rectangular parcels currently used by Toyota of Orange. The existing Toyota of Orange Dealership consists of a two-story, 44,000 sq ft building for auto sales and includes 37 automotive service bays at the south end of the site. Most of the remaining site is paved for drive aisles, vehicular display, vehicle storage, and customer or employee parking. Minor landscaping fills the remainder of the site. Photographs of the existing site are provided in Attachment 4.
<i>Surrounding Land Uses and Zoning:</i>	Use Zoning North Commercial - Plant Nursery and Retail Commercial Limited Business Tustin Redevelopment Project Area (C-TR) South Commercial shopping plaza (Tuskatella Center) Limited Business Tustin Redevelopment Project Area (C-TR) West Commercial - Toyota of Orange Service Center Limited Business Tustin Redevelopment Project Area (C-TR) East Residential - Single Family Homes and Mobile Homes Single Family Residential (R-1-7) & Mobile Home Residential (M-H)

<p><i>Previous Applications/Entitlements:</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On May 9, 1989, Zone Change No. 1060, Conditional Use Permit No. 154 and Tentative Parcel Map No. 86-374 were approved permitting an auto dealership. This approval combined residential lots to facilitate the vehicle display and storage area. • On January 21, 1998, the Design Review Committee denied Design Review No. 3281 for a proposal to expand the existing auto dealership. • On December 20, 2000, the Staff Review Committee approved Minor Site Plan Review No. 168 for the expansion of the existing auto dealership with a 5,600 SF showroom, sales area, conference room and offices. • On January 10, 2001, the Design Review Committee Approved Design Review No. 3608 for the expansion of the existing auto dealership with a 1,303 SF showroom, conference room and 770 SF mezzanine for storage (Phase 1). • On June 4, 2001, the Planning Commission approved Conditional Use Permit No. 2364 for the expansion of the existing auto dealership with the construction of a five-bay car wash/auto detailing structure, a new building for parts storage, a trash enclosure, and a service kiosk. • On October 16, 2002, the Design Review Committee approved Design Review No. 3787 for the installation of freestanding shade canopies for vehicle display areas. • On June 7, 2001, the Zoning Administrator approved Variance No. 2096 to allow for building signage larger than what is allowed under the OMC on the main dealership building. • On August 3, 2011, the Design Review Committee approved Design Review No. 4549 to allow for the exterior façade remodel of the existing dealership building.
---	---

6. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Toyota of Orange, a new and used auto sales and service business located at 1400 N. Tustin Street, is proposing to update its existing service advisor center to provide additional customer service at intake, expand office facilities, dedicate a new car delivery area under a new shade canopy structure, modify current site circulation, and reconfigure the back service vehicle storage and inventory lot with new CMU screen walls. The project includes a two-story, 12,190 sq ft addition to the existing 44,000 sq ft dealership building for additional offices and file storage, which will result in a 56,190 sq ft building, measuring a maximum of 27 feet in height, and resulting in a floor area ratio (FAR) of 0.23.

The proposed two-story, 12,190 sq ft addition will add 5,710 sq ft on the first floor providing approximately 20 offices for service advisors. The second floor addition of 6,480 sq ft provides 2,750 sq ft for file storage, and 3,730 sq ft for administrative offices.

The proposed project meets all development standards and is consistent with the existing GC General Plan Land Use Element designation and C-TR zoning designation.

The existing dealership is located within Thematic District #4 of the Tustin Street Design Standards and has been a part of the visual fabric of North Tustin Street for the past 50 years. All vehicles shall be serviced inside the building in keeping with the district requirements for automotive services. The project screens all service vehicles behind a 6' high CMU side yard wall from the visibility of the

neighbors at the back of the site, and from North Tustin Street.

New side yard walls will be used to define the protected service and inventory stalls. Other site improvements include a new outdoor customer waiting area in front of the service intake outfitted with a similar shade structure to the existing vehicle covers, outdoor patio seating, protective side walls, and interlocking pavers. The new car delivery area, which is an area where new cars bought by customers are temporarily parked for convenient pickup, will have the same improved interlocking pavers for vehicle display and a shade structure for vehicle coverage.

Additional details regarding the architecture of the proposed building addition, site landscaping, and fencing and walls can be found in the Design Review Committee staff report (Attachment 2).

Functional Design of Onsite Circulation

Primary vehicle traffic will be through Toyota Way as has existed for the past 50 years. The inclusion of the northern drive is for added traffic relief on-site to allow service vehicle testing and return, customer test drives, and general customer and employee departure to relieve the outgoing vehicle flow at Toyota Way.

Customer test drives will exit through the northern drive and return at Toyota Way. Customer departure will be through the northern drive past the proposed security kiosk.

Service vehicle intake and return occurs at the six drive lanes provided as part of the remodel. Directional control (with overhead electronic lane markers) of those lanes will vary throughout the day based on incoming and outgoing volume. Service vehicles are staged onsite at the dealership or transferred by staff to the site at 1485 N. Tustin Street, depending on type and length of service. Serviced vehicles returned to customers will be brought for customer pick up at the two southern-most lanes for easy departure through Toyota Way or customers will be valet shuttled directly to their vehicle at the 1485 N. Tustin Street site.

No vehicles will enter or exit from E. Trenton Avenue. This connection is only for emergency vehicles.

Parking

The project provides all required off-street parking spaces, including spaces required for the new addition. A total of 178 parking spaces is required and 190 off-street parking spaces are provided. The area where parking is provided for the new and used car inventory is not counted towards the required off-street parking spaces because the area is classified as storage, rather than parking. Hence, the 84 parking spaces shown for the new and used car inventory is storage space in addition to the 190 parking spaces provided for required parking.

Loading

Per OMC Sections 17.34.160 and 17.34.180(B), loading area requirements may be modified through the site plan or conditional use permit process where it can be shown that the requirements are inconsistent with the proposed use. A formalized loading zone is not provided on the site. As part of the site plan review application for this site, the application includes a request to continue to operate without a formal loading zone. New car inventory will continue to be delivered across the street at 1485 N. Tustin Street and then be shuttled to the dealership by staff on an as needed basis. This existing method has been working without issues.

Development Standards

	Required	Proposed	Code Section
<i>Building Height</i>	32 feet	27 feet	17.18.120
<i>Fence height</i>	No requirement to have a fence when not adjacent to residential uses 42 inches in front yard setback (first 10 feet) 6 feet in all other areas	Existing walls to remain at southerly and westerly residential-adjacent property lines.	17.12.070
<i>Floor Area Ratio (FAR)</i>	1.0 FAR	0.23	General Plan, Land Use Element
<i>Landscaping (non-residential)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Front - 10 feet • Interior side and rear yards - 4 feet or, when adjacent to perpendicular parking, 6 feet • Parking area screening from a public street with 5-gallon shrubs, 3 feet on center. • Trash Enclosures require a 4 foot wide landscaped planter on at least 2 sides. • 25 percent of required trees need to be 24- inch box and 75 percent need to be in 15-gallon containers. • 108 trees required “unless determined otherwise through site plan and design review” • Shrubs shall be 5-gallon except for groundcover. 	<p>Note: existing landscaping is not being modified. Therefore, it is legal nonconforming and does not have to comply with current landscape code.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Varies between 7 and 10 feet • 0 feet north & west sides • 5 feet south side • None • Trash enclosure is existing non-conforming • All trees are existing mature trees; to be protected in place. • 29 trees provided • Shrubs are 1, 5 and 15 gallon plus groundcover provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 17.18.160A.1.a. • 17.18.160A.1.b. • 17.18.160A.2. • 17.18.160A.3. • 17.18.160B.1.a.i. • 17.18.160B.1.a. and a.ii. • 17.18.160B.1.b.

<i>Landscaping (non-residential)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shrubs are <i>encouraged</i> at the foundation lines of all building elevations seen from the street in 4-foot minimum width planters. Shrubs shall be spaced at 3 feet on center. • Street trees required as determined by the design review process. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shrubs provided at the east (street facing) and south (rear) property lines in planters that are 7-foot or greater in width. • No street trees required by Public Works. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 17.18.160B.1.b.i. • 17.18.160B.2.
<i>Loading area (non-residential)</i>	One loading zone 10 feet wide by 60 feet long required. "Loading area requirements may be modified through the <i>site plan</i> or conditional use permit process where it can be shown that the requirements are inconsistent with the proposed use."	Loading requirements to be modified via the conditional use permit process. A formalized loading zone is not provided. Loading will occur across the street at 1485 N. Tustin Street.	17.34.160 and 17.34.180(B)
<i>Parking (non-residential)</i>	Service: 3.5/1000 Storage: 2.5/1000 Parts Sales: 4/1000 Show Rm./Admin: 2.5/1000 Display: .33/1000 178 off-street spaces required	190 off-street spaces provided with additional 300 sq ft of motorcycle parking provided. Bicycle rack provided.	Table 17.34.060.B
<i>Setback, Front</i>	10 feet	130 feet	17.18.130
<i>Setback, Rear</i>	0 feet	0 feet	17.18.130
<i>Setback, Side Interior</i>	0 feet	0 feet	17.18.130

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

The project site is located in an urbanized area of the City surrounded by commercial and residential uses. The project's architectural design is compatible with the surrounding uses and would not result

in alteration or modification of the existing public street or sidewalk systems and patterns in the area. The proposed architecture for the building addition is compatible with the existing dealership building. The proposed project would be consistent with the City of Orange General Plan goals by integrating the proposed project and existing development with nearby existing transit corridors, and commercial and residential uses in the surrounding area.

Issue 1: Access

A new 25-foot-wide access from E. Trenton Avenue is proposed as part of the project. This new access is made part of this project to comply with current fire department requirements. The proposed driveway will be blocked by a proposed gate and shall be used only for emergency access and shall not be used for the dealership operations.

8. PUBLIC NOTICE

A notice of public hearing was posted at the project site and sent on September 26, 2024, to all property owners and tenants within a 400-foot radius of the project site.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 (Class 32 - In-fill Development), because (a) the project is consistent with the General Commercial General Plan Designation, all applicable General Plan policies, and all development standards of the C-TR zoning designation, (b) the project site is 4.15 acres surrounded by urban uses, (c) the project site has no value as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species, (d) the project would not result in any significant effects related to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality, and (e) the project site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

Further analysis finding the proposed project is exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 is provided in Attachment 6.

10. ADVISORY BOARD ACTION

Staff Review Committee:

The City's inter-departmental Staff Review Committee (SRC) conducted reviews of the project on August 30, 2023, November 29, 2023, March 20, 2024, and on July 17, 2024. At the July 17, 2024, meeting the SRC recommended that the project proceed to the Design Review Committee (DRC).

Design Review Committee:

The Design Review Committee reviewed the subject proposal at the September 4, 2024, meeting and recommended project approval to the Planning commission with a condition that the applicant work with staff to add additional trees. The applicant had originally proposed the removal of two trees. Plans now reflect no net loss of trees. Two trees are relocated north of the central customer parking area.

11. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1- Resolution No. PC 26-24
- Attachment 2 - Staff Report from the September 4, 2024, Design Review Committee meeting
- Attachment 3 - Meeting Minutes from the September 4, 2024, Design Review Committee meeting
- Attachment 4 - Project Vicinity Map
- Attachment 5 - Site Photos

- Attachment 6 - Applicant Project Justification Letter
- Attachment 7 - Development Plans
- Attachment 8 - Environmental Analysis