TO: **Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee**

THRU: **Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director**

FROM: **Chad Ortlieb, Senior Planner**

1. SUBJECT

..title

Design Review No. 5019, Well 28, 235 W. Maple Avenue

..end

2. SUMMARY

..recommendation

Provide comments for staff, Planning Commission, and City Council consideration

..body

The City will be constructing a new City well in a walled enclosure and will construct a mini park on the parcel perimeter. Sixteen-foot high brick veneer architectural screen walls with clinging vines surround the well equipment and also are meant to mimic a building façade.

..end

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: City of Orange

Property Location: 235 W. Maple Avenue

General Plan Designation: Public Facilities Max 0.5 FAR and Institutions Max 2.0 FAR (PFI)

Zoning Classification: Public Institution (P-I(SP)), Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan, and Chapman University Specific Plan

Existing Development: The site is vacant

Associated Application: Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 1861-18

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

At this time preliminary plans for the project have been deemed adequate for purposes of presentation to the Design Review Committee and for completing the project environmental analysis. Plan details and refinements such as exact material finishes and colors, landscaping specimens and quantities, and lighting will occur with final plan creation. A color and material board is not available at this time.

Well Facilities

The proposed facility will be located in the northeast corner of the project site within a 3,900 square foot area that is surrounded by a sixteen-foot high brick veneer and clinging

vine-clad architectural screen wall that will provide security, sound buffering, and screen the well facilities from off-site views. A concrete base plate and cornice top cap will accompany the enclosure wall. The screen walls around the well infrastructure will be setback five feet from the north and east property lines and will utilize a metal fence to close perimiter access at the side setback areas. The proposed well is a 500-horsepower vertical turbine pump that will be within an approximately 400 square foot 14-foot high sound enclosure structure. The well system inside the enclosure also includes pump control valves, steel piping, appurtenances, and an air gap structure. The project will also install a 550 square foot 14-foot high cement block building with an electrical room and a chemical room for disinfection equipment.

Access into the well equipment area will be by a fourteen-foot high automatic rolling gate and a man gate entrance to the main switchboard, electrical room, and chemical room.

A new Southern California Edison (SCE) transformer will be installed adjacent to the architectural screen wall and driveway next to the well facilities. The transformer will be ten-feet wide and eight feet long and will be screened by landscaping.

Passive Mini-Park

The southwestern portion of the project site will be developed with an 11,780 square foot passive mini-park. The mini-park will incorporate the use of permeable surfaces, such as decomposed granite, and impermeable surfaces, such as concrete panels. The mini-park will also include decorative fencing, decorative panels, park benches, tree planters with seating, removable bollards, lighting, landscaping, and trash receptacles. Access to the mini-park will be provided by a decomposed granite path with entrances on both Maple Avenue and Lemon Street.

Architecture

Proposed sixteen-foot architectural screen walls (well structure) surrounding the well are designed to screen well equipment and are meant to mimic a building façade. The well structure will utilize simple materials found within the context of the Santa Fe Depot District in Old Towne Orange. Clay brick with running bond application will be used for the veneer on all four elevations of the structure to blend in with the existing masonry of the residential, commercial, and institutional buildings throughout Old Towne, in addition to the Metrolink parking structure on the southwest corner of the Maple Avenue and Lemon Street intersection. The sixteen-foot high architectural screen walls will include metal trellis wall treatments that will be vegetated. These areas will be recessed approximately six inches and will be clad with the same brick veneer as the rest of the building. Metal doors are proposed on the south elevation along Maple Avenue, which will be painted a terra-cotta color to match the brick and will be intentionally non-descript. Brick wall bonding patterns will be enhanced at the elevations of the man-door and trellises for visual interest.

Landscaping

Once constructed, the project site will be landscaped with ornamental shrubs and trees and open turf areas for recreational activities. In addition, the proposed architectural screen walls will incorporate the use of trellis wall treatments that will be vegetated.

5. EXISTING SITE

The site is vacant, paved with asphalt, and has a six-foot tall chain fence around the perimiter.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The project is in the Old Towne Historic District, the Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan area, and the Chapman University Specific Plan area. Land uses surrounding the project site include a parking lot for Chapman University to the west across N. Lemon Street, residential and the Metrolink parking structure to the southwest across W. Maple Avenue, light industrial uses adjacent to the north, and a Chapman University office and residential uses to the east.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

No issues exist for this project because the design and construction are under City staff oversight to meet City specifications in relation to water supply needs, area context, and site design. Potentially significant environmental effects have been mitigated to less than significant with the mitigation measures provided in Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 1861-18.

Pursuant to Government Code sections 53090(a) and 53091(a) the City is not required to comply with the strict application of its zoning ordinances. Although no particular zoning standards deviations have been identified for this project, the project has been reviewed by staff and designed in a manner compatible with height, massing, architecture and landscaping that integrate with the project surroundings. Refinement of project plans with consideration of any comments received from the DRC are anticipated to further the public benefit of the project.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

The Streamlined Multi-Disciplinary Accelerated Review Team (SMART) reviewed the project on July 22, 2020, and recommended the project proceed with technical comments to be addressed in plan check.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

Public noticing for Planning Commission Review will occur at the time MND No. 1861-18 is released for public comment. Subsequently City Council noticing will occur.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Mitigated Negative Declaration: Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 1861-18 was prepared to evaluate the physical environmental impacts of the project, in conformance with the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15070 and in conformance with the Local CEQA Guidelines. The Mitigated Negative Declaration finds that the project will have less than significant impacts to the environment, with the implementation of standard conditions and mitigation measures related to unanticipated archeological, human remains, paleontological, or tribal cultural resource finds. The 30-day public review period was initiated on October 29, 2020 and ends on November 29, 2020. Copies of the document are available for public review at City Hall and on the City website.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a “Finding” as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body “makes a Finding,” or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The “Findings” are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

Findings for DRC applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code (OMC)
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC provide comments for staff, Planning Commission, and City Council consideration.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.G.1).

  Consistent with the guidance provided for infill construction in the Historic Preservation Design Standards, the well facility enclosure uses clay brick veneer in a running bond application similar to that used on the Metrolink Parking Structure. Though no particular architectural style in the Santa Fe Depot area of Old Towne is mimicked, the well facility enclosure’s use of brick veneer comparable to that used on the Metrolink station will ensure that materials used blend with area architecture and distinguish the point in time in which the utility structure was constructed. The mini park landscaping and metal trellis features on the brick veneer walls will also minimize the presence of the well enclosure as viewed from the right-of-way. The well and well enclosure is tucked into the northeast corner of the site which is a logical transitional position given the industrial buildings to the north and the residential buildings to the south and east. Additionally, the positioning facilitates the greatest amount of use for the remaining area as a mini park. The building maintenance entry will be parallel to Maple Avenue and the rolling door will be painted a color complimentary of the brick used on the building. The height of the enclosure will also be comparable to a residential structure and transition from the height of the northerly industrial buildings. Furthermore, the height of the enclosure would screen the fourteen foot high sound enclosure inside.

- In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.G.2).

  Projects found to be in conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne are generally considered to be in conformance with the

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. As reinforced in the above finding, the project consists of new construction within a historic district that is compatible with the massing, scale, size, and architectural features of surrounding historic buildings. It will create a site that contains a necessary new utility structure utilizing materials, placement, and landscaping that assist with appropriate transitional establishment of the use from adjacent uses.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.G.3).

  The project well enclosure has an internally consistent, integrated design theme in that it uses clay brick veneer in a running bond application similar to that used on the Metrolink Parking Structure. Though no particular architectural style in the Santa Fe Depot area of Old Towne is mimicked, the well facility enclosure's use of brick veneer comparable to that used on the Metrolink station will ensure that the materials blend with area architecture and help establish the point in time in which the utility structure is constructed. The mini park landscaping and metal trellis features on the brick veneer walls will also minimize the presence of the well enclosure as viewed from the right-of-way. The well and well enclosure is tucked into the northeast corner of the site which is a logical transitional position given the industrial buildings to the north and the residential buildings to the south and east. Additionally, the positioning facilitates the greatest amount of use for the remaining area as a mini park. The building maintenance entry is parallel to Maple Avenue and the rolling door will be painted a color complimentary of the brick used on the building. The height of the enclosure will also be comparable to residential structures and will transition from the height of the northerly industrial buildings. Furthermore, the height of the enclosure will screen the fourteen foot high sound enclosure inside.

  The project is in the Santa Fe Depot Specific plan which applies Secretary of the Interior's Standards applicable to new construction. As part of the standards, the new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment. The project accomplishes differentiation with its contemporary simplified architecture and utilizes brick veneer to give the appearance of historic brick use but also matches the newer Metrolink parking structure. The size, scale, proportion and massing of the property is transitionally appropriate when compared to the size and position of adjacent structures and is appropriate for the utility nature of the use. Features such as windows are not needed for the use and are replaced with metal trellis features on the building for vine treatment and with an entry door oriented toward Maple Avenue. The enclosure has no roof but mimics a flat roof, as is the case with the adjacent parking structure and residential building to the east. As such, the project meets all the following criteria identified in the Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan:

  - The project shall be compatible with surrounding development and neighborhoods.

- The development shall be consistent in size, scale and context with surrounding development.
- Building design, colors and material shall be compatible with the character of the existing structure and surrounding area.
- The development shall not erode or adversely affect an historic resource or district.
- The relationship between buildings and the street, with the front and primary entrances oriented to the street.
- The relation of street and side yard setbacks to historic buildings.
- The mass and scale of new designs in relation to historic buildings. New designs should draw upon massing and scale of similar buildings in the area.
- The height and width of new buildings should complement nearby historic buildings.
- Primary building forms, including roof forms, should refer to historic forms found in the area. Contemporary interpretations of building forms reflecting the design traditions of the area may also be used.
- Designing with a palate of materials used historically. New materials, when used, should appear similar in character, form and texture, to historic materials.
- A variety of windows types should be encouraged. Contemporary interpretations of industrial sash, wood sash and display windows may be considered.

The project is also in the Chapman University Specific Plan (CUSP), although future removal of the property from the plan area is anticipated because it is no longer a site targeted for use by the university. Well No. 28 has been designed in a manner that meets Objectives 2.1a, 2.2, 3.1, 5.1, 7.2, and Policy 2.1b of the specific plan in that the well site provides an aesthetic and functional relationship to surrounding facilities through the minimization of site massing and provision of open space, accommodates edge development transition via establishment of a mini park, accomplishes coordinated planning for transitioning from campus facilities and, provides for water infrastructure to serve the university.

The project is further consistent with the Design Guidelines of Section 5 of the CUSP in that, as described in the findings text above, the project preserves the overall historic character of the area, is a compatible addition to existing development with consistent material use, is of appropriate transitional massing, maintains a coordinated street scene, and maintains a cube-like building form.

12. CONDITIONS

The City, as a regulating authority, does not seek to condition its own projects. Staff will ensure the approved project meets goals to accomplish completion pursuant to City needs.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 – Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 – Conceptual Site Plan
- Attachment 3 – Preliminary Elevations

- Attachment 4 – Landscape Plan
- Attachment 5 - Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 1861-18 (hardcopy)