



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 3.2.

4/21/2021

File #: 21-0194

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner - Historic Preservation

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5032-21, Tigner Residence, 151-155 S. Parker Street

2. SUMMARY

Final determination by the Design Review Committee

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing detached two-car garage and construct a new bedroom and garage addition between the two single-family residences on the property located at 151-155 S. Parker Street. The property is a non-contributing resource to the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Lori Tigner

Architect: Donnie Dewees

Property Location: 151-155 S. Parker Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Single-Family Residential (R-1-6)

Existing Development: Two single-family residences (872 square feet and 854 square feet) and a 389 square foot detached garage

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing detached two-car garage and construct a new addition between two existing single-family residences on the property. The addition will consist of a one bedroom, one bathroom expansion to the front residence (151 S. Parker Street) and a new two-car garage. The addition will physically connect the two residences, but both residences will remain independent dwelling units. The addition matches the roof height and pitch, the window size, and cement plaster finish on the exterior of the building.

Detailed architectural plans are included as Attachment 2 of this report. The project as proposed

meets the development standards for the R-1-6 zoning district.

5. EXISTING SITE

The project property is developed with two detached single-family residences with a detached two-car garage located inbetween both units. The property was constructed as a duplex in 1956 when the area was zoned R-2 and met all development requirements, including parking, at the time it was built.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located on the east side of S. Parker Street, mid-block between W. Chapman Avenue and W. Almond Avenue. The block is located in the southwest quadrant of Old Towne, in the local historic district boundaries. Properties on all sides are zoned R-1-6, but consistent of a mix of duplex and single-family residences.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Overall, it is the opinion of staff that the proposed project is of an appropriate mass, scale, and design to complement existing development on the property and comply with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (hereafter Design Standards). However, staff has identified one issue item that prevents staff from recommending approval of the project as presented at this time.

Issue 1: Existing Vinyl Windows

The applicant has proposed to install vinyl windows in the addition to the house to match existing windows. The Design Standards explicitly calls out vinyl as not an appropriate material within the Old Towne Historic District. Material substitutions may be considered by the Design Review Committee (DRC) during project review. In practice, vinyl as a material is discouraged in the historic district boundaries.

City Building Division records show that building permits were issued for window change-outs for both residences in 2004. The permits did not specify the material for the replacement windows. However, both permits expired with no completed inspections in 2006.

Staff requests that the DRC make a determination on the use of an alternative material (vinyl) for the windows on the proposed addition. Should the DRC move to approve the proposed project, standard conditions of approval have been provided for reference as Attachment 3 of this report.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None required.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None required.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15303 (Class 3 - New Construction and Conversion of Small Structures) because the project consists of the construction of an addition and new garage on a developed residential property.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code (OMC)
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- Orange Eichler Design Standards
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Approval of the proposed project must be made based on the following Findings, with conditions as deemed appropriate by the DRC.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).
- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).

12. CONDITIONS

Since staff has not made a recommendation of approval on this project, no conditions of approval have been provided. Should the DRC approve the project, standard conditions of approval have been provided for reference as Attachment 3.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 Architectural Plans date stamped 4/7/2021
- Attachment 3 Potential Conditions of Approval
- Attachment 4 DPR Form for 151-155 S. Parker Street