



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 4.3.

7/8/2021

File #: 21-0367

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner - Historic Preservation

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5031-21, Chapman Olive Residence, 321 N. Olive Street

2. SUMMARY

Final Determination by the Design Review Committee.

The applicant proposes to partially demolish a non-contributing rear addition, construct a new 38 square foot addition, and rehabilitate the front porch of an existing single-family residence. The property is a contributing resource to the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Chapman University

Property Location: 321 N. Olive Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Duplex Residential (R-2-6)

Existing Development: 1,066 square foot single-family residence and 502 square foot detached garage

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to rehabilitate a contributing single-family residence in conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (Design Standards). In addition to overall maintenance and repair of the house, the scope of work includes the following items:

- Partial demolition of an existing non-historic rear addition, including replacement of siding and windows and reconstruction of the roofline in a gable form to match the rest of the residence.
- Addition of an additional 38 square feet onto the existing addition to extend the bedroom

footprint.

- Installation of new architecturally compatible windows and doors on the rear (east) and south elevations.
- Construction of new entry stoops and patio at the rear elevation to replace missing steps.
- Repair brick porch columns on the front elevation.

Detailed plans and photographs are included as Attachment 3 of this report. The proposed work meets the development standards for the R-2-6 zoning district.

5. EXISTING SITE

The project property is a contributing resource to the National Register-listed Old Towne Historic District. The one-story Craftsman Bungalow was constructed c.1915. The detached two-car garage was constructed in 1991 (Building Permit #22071). The construction date of the shed roof addition to the rear of the house is unknown, but it appears to be after 1940.

Overall, the property retains a medium to high degree of historic integrity but is currently in poor condition. Notably, the front porch columns are deteriorating, with some bricks missing from the bases, and the rear of the house has been subject to several alterations to window and door fenestration, leaving the siding patched and with exposed holes.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located on the east side of N. Olive Street, north of the intersection with W. Palm Avenue. The house is located west of the Chapman University campus core, in an area of single-family homes predominantly owned by the University as faculty and staff housing. The property is surrounded on all sides by residential properties (R-1-6 and R-2-6) that are also contributing resources to the Old Towne Historic District.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

No issue items have been identified for this project. It is the opinion of staff that the proposed work complies with the requirements for additions as set forth in the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The rear 38 square foot addition will be attached to a non-historic addition to the house and is designed with features to replicate the Craftsman features of the residence, with small differentiations, such as siding style, to indicate that the addition as a whole is not original to the building. The addition is not visible from the street and will not detract from the historic rhythm of the streetscape along N. Olive Street.

New windows and doors on all elevations have been designed to be compatible with existing original fixtures, with details provided on necessary repairs for original historic material.

Finally, details are provided for reconstruction of the front porch column bases, which are in poor condition, to restore them to their original appearance. The porch is a character-defining feature of all

Craftsman-style homes, and the repair work ensures the historic integrity of the house is preserved.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15331 (Class 31 - Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) because the project consists of the removal of a non-historic addition to a historic residence, construction of a compatible rear addition, and rehabilitation of the front porch in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. No public review is required.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).

The project as proposed conforms to the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The rear 38 square foot addition will be attached to a non-historic addition to the house and is designed with features to replicate the Craftsman features of the residence, with small differentiations, such as siding style, to indicate that the addition as a whole is not original to the building. The addition is not visible from the street and will not detract from the historic rhythm of the streetscape along N. Olive Street. New windows and doors on all elevations have been designed to be compatible with existing original fixtures, with details provided on necessary repairs for original historic material. Details are also provided for reconstruction of the front porch column bases, which are in poor condition, to restore them to their original appearance.

- In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).

The project as proposed complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The expanded rear addition utilizes historic design features of the residence, such as the gable roof pitch and wood frame windows, to relate the new addition to the historic portion of the residence. However, the addition is still differentiated as a non-historic addition through use of a different style lap siding and simplified window trim detail. Therefore, the addition cannot be mistaken for an original feature of the building or create a false sense of historical development on the property. The proposed repair work to the front porch columns will restore the design integrity of a character-defining feature of the house. Modifications to the windows and doors on the east and south elevation retain the existing fenestration pattern while replacing inappropriate replacement fixtures with stylistically compatible new fixtures.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).

The proposed project complies with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The project has been designed with features to compliment the Craftsman architectural features of the residence. The expanded rear addition utilizes historic design features of the residence, such as the gable roof pitch and wood frame windows, to relate the new addition to the historic portion of the residence. Modifications to the windows and doors on the east and south elevation retain the existing fenestration pattern while replacing inappropriate replacement fixtures with stylistically compatible new fixtures.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included as Attachment 3 (date stamped June 2, 2021) of this report, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out

of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.

4. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
6. If not utilized, project approval expires 24 months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 - Project Narrative
- Attachment 3 - Architectural Plans date stamped June 2, 2021
- Attachment 4 - Site Photographs
- Attachment 5 - DPR Form for 321 N. Olive Street