



Agenda Item

Design Review Committee

Item #: 4.1.

11/17/2021

File #: 21-0612

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director
FROM: Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5055-21, Stoner Residence, 164 N. Center Street

2. SUMMARY

Final determination by the Design Review Committee.

The applicant proposes to demolish a rear patio and construct a 498 square foot addition to a historic single-family residence in the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Judy and Dan Stoner

Property Location: 164 N. Center Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential, 6-15 dwelling units per acre (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Single-Family Residential (R-1-6)

Existing Development: 1,054 square foot single-family residence and 350 square foot detached accessory storage shed

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project includes demolition of a 327 square foot screened, at-grade patio at the back of the house and construction of a 498 square foot addition containing a family room and bathroom and closet for the primary bedroom. The addition is inset from the corners of the house and has wood siding with an eight inch exposure and wood windows. A rear porch covered by a wood pergola is included in the project. The porch includes concrete steps and a side wall with a scored plaster finish and concrete caps. Details are included in Attachment 5 Project Plans.

5. EXISTING SITE

The site is developed with a 1,054 square foot single-family residence and detached 350 square foot storage shed. The residence was constructed circa 1919 and is a contributor to the Old Towne Historic District. The screened patio at the rear of the house was added after 1947 based on aerial

photographs and observation of the materials used for construction (Attachment 4 Aerial Photograph and Sanborn Map). It is not a character-defining feature of the property because it was constructed after 1940, outside of the period of significance for the historic district.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The property is located on the west side of N. Center Street in a residential area of the Old Towne Historic District. The south side of the street ends in a cul-de-sac adjacent to the Orange Public Library & History Center. Surrounding properties are zoned Single-Family Residential (R-1-6) to the north and east and Old Towne Mixed Use 15 (OTMU-15) to the west. The majority of properties on the block are contributors to the Old Towne Historic District.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Staff has no issues with the proposed project. The project meets the development standards for the Single-Family Residential zoning and is in conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The addition is appropriately differentiated from the historic house through an offset in the wall planes between the original structure and the addition. The addition is slightly shorter than the historic house and will be minimally visible from the street. The materials used for the addition are compatible with the historic house and feature minor changes from the historic materials to distinguish the different periods of construction.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guideline 15331 (Class 31 - Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation), because it consists of a compatible addition to a historic residence. The proposed project will not remove or damage significant historic materials and is appropriately differentiated from the historic house, in conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (SOI Standards)* and the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. There is no public review required for a Categorical Exemption.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from four sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)
- Orange Eichler Design Standards (or OEDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for

the project (OMC 17.10.070.G.1).

The proposed project is in conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne, which are the prescriptive design criteria for projects within the Old Towne Historic District. The addition is compatible with the historic house, located at the rear of the building, and will not significantly alter or obscure character-defining features. The mass and scale of the addition are appropriate for the size of the historic building and for the character of the Historic District. The materials are compatible with the historic house with sufficient differentiation to distinguish the different periods of construction.

- In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.G.2).

Projects found to be in conformance with the Old Towne Design Standards are generally considered to be in conformance with the SOI Standards. In conformance with Standard 2, the existing historic materials will be preserved to the greatest extent feasible and the historic character of the property will be retained. In conformance with Standards 9 and 10, the addition is appropriately differentiated from the historic building and will not destroy historic materials or features that characterize the property. The addition could be removed in the future without impairing the form or integrity of the house. The project will not substantially alter or impair the character of the Historic District as a whole. It is in conformance with the SOI Standards.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.G.3).

Projects located within the Old Towne Historic District must comply with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne and SOI Standards (as applicable). As described above, the proposed work conforms with these design standards.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included as Attachment 5 Project Plans of the staff report dated November 17, 2021, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out

of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.

4. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Public Works Department Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the Public Works Department Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
6. If not utilized, project approval expires 24 months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 Letter of Explanation
- Attachment 3 Historic Resource Survey Form
- Attachment 4 Aerial Photograph and Sanborn Map
- Attachment 5 Project Plans