



City of Orange

Legislation Text

File #: 21-0193, Version: 1

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner - Historic Preservation

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No. 5029-21, Valadez Residence, 139 N. Harwood Street

2. SUMMARY

Final determination by the Design Review Committee.

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing 251 square foot enclosed rear patio and construct a new 360 square foot open porch and trellis for the single-family residence located at 139 N. Harwood Street. The property is a contributing resource to the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Nora Valadez

Architect: Craig B. Wheeler

Property Location: 139 N. Harwood Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Single-Family Residential (R-1-6)

Existing Development: 1,674 square foot single-family residence with 251 square foot attached patio and a detached garage

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposed to demolish an existing 251 square foot enclosed patio and construct a new 350 square foot open porch at the rear of the single-family residence located at 139 N. Harwood Street. The new porch will be constructed at floor level with the residence, with 30 inch high walls on three sides finished with lap siding. The gable roof of the porch is set five inches lower than the existing roofline of the rear of the house, which is a 1969 addition to the original building. Other design features of the porch include a wood finished cathedral ceiling, smooth finish concrete foundation, a brick fireplace and chimney, and brick steps.

In addition to the rear patio, the applicant proposed to construct a new wood trellis along the south

side of the building to provide shade for the side of the residence. The trellis beams will attach to the house underneath the roof outriggers and be supported with 6"x6" posts.

Detailed plans and photographs are included as Attachment 2 of this report. The proposed work meets the development standards for the R-1-6 zoning district, including setbacks.

5. EXISTING SITE

The project property is a contributing resource to the National Register-listed Old Towne Historic District. The one-story Craftsman Bungalow was constructed c.1920. The detached garage dates from the same period as the residence.

Overall, the property retains a high degree of historic integrity. In 1969, a 418 square foot rear addition was added to the house, with architectural details to match the original Craftsman style. The enclosed patio proposed to be demolished is attached to the rear of this addition. The construction date of the patio is unknown.

In addition, the property has an active Mills Act Contract approved in 1999.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located on the east side of N. Harwood Street, north of the intersection with E. Chapman Avenue. The house is located just north of the transition of the office/commercial corridor to an established residential neighborhood. The property is surrounded on all sides by single-family residential properties (R-1-6) that are also contributing resources to the Old Towne Historic District.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

No issue items have been identified for this project. It is the opinion of staff that the proposed work complies with the requirements for additions as set forth in the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The proposed rear porch has been designed with features to replicate the Craftsman features of the residence, with small differentiations, such as siding width, to indicate that the porch is not original to the building. In addition, the porch will be attached to a non-historic addition to the house, creating further separation between the original and newer portions of the house. The porch will also be minimally visible from the public right-of-way and will not detract from the streetscape along N. Harwood Street.

The proposed trellis on the south side of the house is also a complimentary feature with the Craftsman style of the residence. Trellises are a relatively common feature of Craftsman homes, used to provide shade and visual appeal to homes during the original period of construction for the style. The trellis as designed requires minimal attachment to the building and does not require removal or alteration of any character-defining historic features, such as the roof outriggers. Therefore, it is the opinion of staff that the design of the trellis does not detract from the historic architecture of the house.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None required.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None required.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15331 (Class 31 - Historical resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) because the project consists of the removal of a non-historic addition to a historic residence and construction of a compatible rear porch in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. No public review is required.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for Design Review Committee (DRC) applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code (OMC)
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- Orange Eichler Design Standards
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).

The project as proposed conforms to the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The rear porch addition will be attached to a non-historic addition to the house and is designed with features to replicate the Craftsman features of the residence, with small differentiations, such as siding width, to indicate that the porch is not original to the building. The porch will also be minimally visible from the public right-of-way and will not detract from the historic rhythm of the streetscape along N. Harwood Street. The south elevation trellis will be visible from the street, but is designed to replicate the type of shade trellis sometimes found as an original historic feature of Craftsman-style homes. The trellis as designed requires minimal attachment to the building and does not require removal or alteration of any character-defining historic features, such as the roof outriggers. Therefore, it will not negatively impact the historic character of the property.

- In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).

The project as proposed complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The porch addition utilizes historic design features of the residence, such as the pyramid columns, gable roof pitch, and lap siding, to relate the new addition to the historic portion of the residence. However, the addition is still differentiated as a non-historic addition through attachment to another 1969 addition to the house, use of narrower siding width, and taller exposed concrete foundation walls. Therefore the porch cannot be mistaken for an original feature of the building or create a false sense of historical development on the property. The proposed trellis has a historically-inspired design but will be constructed with modern lumbar and attachment techniques, which also differentiates it as a non-historic addition to the building.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).

The proposed project complies with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The project has been designed with features to compliment the Craftsman architectural features of the residence. The use of lap siding, pyramid-shaped columns, and gable roof echo the features of the front porch of the house and create an internally consistent design vocabulary for the addition. The south side trellis provides for shade to the side of the building using a style-appropriate feature found on other Craftsman homes of the same era in a non-historic configuration.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included as Attachment 2 (date stamped April 7, 2021) of this report, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
4. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
6. If not utilized, project approval expires 24 months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 Architectural Plans date stamped April 7, 2021
- Attachment 3 DPR Form for 139 N. Harwood Street