



City of Orange

Legislation Text

File #: 21-0366, Version: 1

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Kelly Ribuffo, Associate Planner - Historic Preservation

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No.5021-21, Pearce Residence, 428 N. Lemon Street

2. SUMMARY

Final Determination by the Design Review Committee.

The applicant proposes to demolish a non-contributing rear addition, construct a new 242 square foot addition, and relocate the front door of an existing single-family residence. The property is a contributing resource to the Old Towne Historic District.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Joe Pearce

Property Location: 428 N. Lemon Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Two Family Residential (R-2-6)

Existing Development: 1,038 square foot single-family residence, approximately 300 square foot detached garage, and 720 square foot detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU)

Associated Application: None

Previous DRC Project Review: None

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing flat-roof rear addition, construct a new 242 square foot addition, and relocate the main residence entry door to the front elevation as part of an interior renovation to the house. Design features of the addition include:

- Gable roofline with shed roof dormer
- 3-foot wide vertical wood board and batten siding

- French doors into backyard from the kitchen dining area
- Rear porch stepping down to deck at grade

The new front door will have a concrete stoop stepping down into the front yard, with a new concrete walkway to the city sidewalk.

Detailed plans and photographs are included as Attachment 2 of this report. The proposed work meets the development standards for the R-2-6 zoning district. 430 N. Lemon Street, a 720 square foot ADU, has been included in the plan set for design reference only.

5. EXISTING SITE

The subject property is a contributing resource to the National Register-listed Old Towne Historic District. The one-story Craftsman-style home was constructed in 1911. The detached single-car garage appears to be older construction, but is not original to the property according to the 1922 and 1950 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps (Attachment 5). The construction date of the shed roof addition to the rear of the house is unknown. A new 720 square foot ADU, 430 N. Lemon Street, is currently in Building Division plan check pending building approval (Permit #2102-158). Construction of an ADU is allowed by state law on the site due to the residential zoning.

Overall, the property retains a low to moderate degree of historic integrity. Notably, the original open front porch at the southeast corner of the house (as shown in Attachment 5) was enclosed by permit in 1953 (Building Permit #8039). As a result, the front door was relocated to the south side of the house and a large three-part window was installed on the front (east) elevation.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located mid-block on the west side of N. Lemon Street, north of the intersection with W. Sycamore Avenue. The house is located in the northwest quadrant of the Old Towne Historic District, in the historic Cypress Street Barrio neighborhood. The property is surrounded on all sides by single-family and multi-family residential properties (R-2-6), some of which are contributing resources to the Old Towne Historic District (Attachment 1).

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1. Relocation of Front Door

The applicant proposes to relocate the entry door to the house as part of an interior renovation to the floor plan of the house. Currently, the entry is on the south side of the house, facing the driveway. It appears this change was made in 1953, when the original front porch was enclosed. The door will be moved to the front elevation of the house, accessing the new living room area.

There is an observed precedent in Old Towne that when front porches are enclosed, the new front door is generally located in the area of the new elevation where the porch once was, and not into another area of the house. Relocating the entry door as proposed will place it back on the front of the housing facing N. Lemon Street, which is the original elevation.

The enclosure of the front porch has already altered the appearance of the house from the street, it is the opinion of staff that the overall historic integrity of the house would not be substantially diminished by the relocation of the door to the proposed location. Furthermore, relocating the front door to the

proposed location would retain the existing fenestration of the house, which itself is a record of the development history of the property. Having the front door visible from the street will also enhance the safety of the entrance for residents. Therefore, it is the opinion of staff that the proposed door relocation complies with Standard #3.

Issue 2. Compatibility of Addition:

The applicant proposes to demolish an existing rear addition to the house and replace it with a new 242 square foot addition in roughly the same location.

It is the opinion of staff that the location and size of the new addition is appropriate. The addition will connect to the rear of the house in the same places the existing addition does, so no further original fabric will have to be altered to accommodate it. The addition will also not be visible from the street, maintaining the appearance of the mass of the house from N. Lemon Street.

Furthermore, the new addition is a more appropriate design in keeping with the vernacular of the house. The board and batten siding differentiates the addition from the lap siding of the original footprint, while the style of the windows, window trim, and roofline relate the addition to original features of the house.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

None.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15331 (Class 31 - Historical resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) because the project consists of the removal of a non-historic addition to a historic residence, construction of a compatible rear addition, and relocation of the front door in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. No public review is required.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from three sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Staff recommends that the DRC approve the proposed project. Final determination on the project shall be based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings.

- In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).

The project as proposed conforms to the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The new rear addition will be attached to a portion of the residence previously impacted by a past addition and will not require removal of additional original material from the house. The new addition is designed with features to replicate the Craftsman features of the residence, with differentiations, such as siding style, to indicate that the addition as a whole is not original to the building. The addition is not visible from the street and will not detract from the historic rhythm of the streetscape along N. Lemon Street. Relocation of the main residence entry door from the side to the front of the house will restore access to the house from the streetside elevation, which is the original orientation of the entrance, with minimal alteration to the front elevation.

- In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).

The project as proposed complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The new rear addition utilizes historic design features of the residence, such as the gable roof pitch and wood frame windows, to relate the new addition to the historic portion of the residence. However, the addition is still differentiated as a non-historic addition through use of a different siding style. The design of the addition ensures that it will not be mistaken for an original portion of the house. The proposed relocation of the main residence entry door to the front elevation of the house restores access to the house from the streetside elevation, which is the original orientation of the entrance, with minimal alteration to the front elevation.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).

The proposed project complies with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne. The project has been designed with features to compliment the Craftsman architectural features of the residence. The new rear addition utilizes historic design features of the residence, such as the gable roof pitch and wood frame windows, to relate the new addition to the historic portion of the residence. The relocated main residence entry door will also be of a compatible style with the residence.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with the plans included as Attachment 3 (date stamped April 25, 2021) of this report, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review

Committee.

2. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public meeting.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
4. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.

If not utilized, project approval expires 24 months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 - Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 - Architectural Plans date stamped April 25, 2021
- Attachment 3 - Site Photographs
- Attachment 4 - Excerpt from 1922/1950 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map
- Attachment 5 - DPR Form for 428 N. Lemon Street