



City of Orange

Legislation Text

File #: 22-0196, Version: 1

TO: Chair and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Anna Pehoushek, Assistant Community Development Director

FROM: Vidal F. Márquez, Assistant Planner

1. SUBJECT

Design Review No.4799-15, St. Verena Coptic Orthodox Church Multi-Purpose Service Building, 941 N. Hewes Street

2. SUMMARY

Recommendation to the Planning Commission.

The applicant proposes to construct a 17,762 square foot multi-purpose service building to include a gymnasium, observation spaces, Sunday school class rooms, kitchen, restrooms, storage rooms, and minor landscape improvements on an existing church property.

3. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Coptic Orthodox Church - Diocese of Los Angeles and St. Verena Coptic Orthodox Church

Property Location: 941 N. Hewes Street

General Plan Designation: Low Density Residential, 2-6 dwelling units per acre (LDR)

Zoning Classification: Single Family Residential, 7,000 square feet (R-1-7)

Existing Development: St. Verena Coptic Orthodox Church

Associated Application: Major Site Plan Review No.1054-21

Previous DRC Project Review: Conditional Use Permit No. 2741-08, Conditional Use Permit No. 2741-08, Design Review No. 4205-07, and Minor Site Plan Review No. 0502-07 approved by the City on June 1, 2009, authorized the construction of sanctuary expansion, new parking lot, outdoor patio, landscaping improvements and an on-site shared parking agreement for various church and educational activities.

4. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project proposes to replace an existing outdoor basketball court and lawn on the east side of existing sanctuary hall, in order to construct a 17,762 square foot enclosed multi-purpose service building. The multi-purpose service building will be utilized by church parishioners and their youth for the enjoyment of recreational and religious educational activities within an indoor environment. The building will also be used to host social and religious activities related to a youth group, fellowship

services, Church dinners and special events such as Holy Week, Great Lent and other observances. The proposed location of the building will not result in a loss of existing parking spaces. The building will not be used during Sunday Liturgy services, host additional Sunday Liturgy services, will be open to the public, and is not intended to increase the number of people on-site at any given time. It is also not anticipated that the building use would generate additional traffic or require additional parking. The proposed hours of operation of the multi-purpose service building are:

Saturdays:	9:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m.
Sundays	4:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m.

The interior of the building will be configured with approximately 12,173 square feet on the first floor, containing a gymnasium space, observation spaces, class rooms, kitchen, offices, equipment room, electrical room, storage rooms, and restroom facilities. The second level is approximately 5,589 square feet, can be accessed via two interior stairways located in the main foyer, and is on the southeast corner of the building.

The project also includes minor landscape improvements. The property has 89 existing trees and abundant landscape material on-site. A new planter, tree and green screens are proposed to be installed. New concrete walkways and steps provide pedestrian access to the new building and a connection from the existing parking lot to interior walkways. The existing driveway and gates located along the west and north property lines will remain and not be affected.

5. EXISTING SITE

The 2.55-acre church site is situated at the southeast intersection of North Hewes Street and East Walnut Avenue. The site is developed with a sanctuary, administrative offices, one modular office building, preschool, large open landscaped yard, and surface parking lot containing 134 parking stalls.

6. EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

Surrounding development includes single-family residential dwellings to the north, south and west. To the east is an existing parking lot and church property of the 'Spirit & Truth Worship Center'.

7. ANALYSIS AND STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1 Architecture:

The project as proposed complies with all development standards of the R-1-7 zone. The proposed rectangular building will have a maximum height of 28 feet, 8 inches. The building incorporates a simple utilitarian design with architectural features including a mansard roof, stain glass windows on the main entry west elevation, decorative glass blocks, metal landscape green screens, and standing seam metal mechanical roof screening. Exterior materials and colors also contribute to the utilitarian character of the building including concrete masonry walls with split-face concrete accents bands, anodized aluminum windows and doors, aluminum store front doors and terra cotta Mission S-tile roofing material. The overall color scheme of the building incorporates tones of gray, terra cotta, and brown that coordinate with the larger church campus.

New exterior wall sconce light fixtures will be mounted on the building elevations with light shining in a downward direction. No additional improvements are proposed to the church site. Staff believes the architectural design and materials are sufficient to alleviate any architectural concerns.

Issue 2 Landscaping:

The applicant will remove six existing trees surrounding the basketball court yard area and will retain two trees. The landscape plans indicate one 24-inch box 'Pink Trumpet' tree to be installed in a planter in the parking area and three unidentified trees to be installed north of the proposed building. In the new parking lot planter, details indicate new plantings will consist of the 'Pink Trumpet' tree and 5-gallon 'Raphiolepes Clara' and 'Myrtus C. Compacta Variegata' shrubs. The project will also install 12-inch planters for fifteen metal landscape green screens with 'Mandavillea' white and red flower vines around the new building to add interest and help soften the building massing as viewed from southern and eastern elevations. The overall project will have an internally consistent design that integrates with the existing church campus and surrounding residential properties. Staff has not identified any issues with project landscaping.

8. ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

The City's inter-departmental staff review committee (SMART) conducted a review of the project on June 23, 2021, October 6, 2021 and on March 2, 2022 recommended project approval to the Design Review Committee (DRC) with conditions.

9. PUBLIC NOTICE

On August 4, 2022, the City sent a Public Meeting Notice to a total of 86 property owners/occupants within a 400-foot radius of the project site and persons specifically requesting notice. The project site has been posted at two locations with the notification on that same date.

10. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15332 (Class 32: In-Fill Development Projects) because the project is consistent with the City's General Plan and zoning regulations, is located on a site that is less than 5 acres, is not located in an area that is environmentally sensitive, will not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality or water quality, and the site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services. There is no environmental public review or notice required for a categorical exemption.

11. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

Findings for DRC applications come from four sources:

- The Orange Municipal Code
- The Infill Residential Design Guidelines
- The Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne (commonly referred to the Old Towne Design Standards or OTDS)
- Orange Eichler Design Standards (or OEDS)

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC recommend approval of the project with recommended conditions.

- The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.G.3).

The proposed multi-purpose service building will blend with the existing building architecture,

utilizing a rectangular shape, flat and mansard roof design, and exterior colors that match the existing buildings. The proposed minor landscape improvements will soften the proposed building elevations and metal standing seam parapet will screen mechanical equipment, and provide for a more revitalized appearance in the area of the new building. The project overall will have an internally consistent design that integrates with the existing church property and surrounding residential properties that will uphold community aesthetics.

12. CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. The project shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with plans (date stamped received March 14, 2022) that were reviewed by the Design Review Committee, including any modifications required by conditions of approval.
2. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plot plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan administratively.
3. Subsequent modifications to the approved architecture and color scheme shall be submitted for review and approval to the Community Development Director or designee. Should modifications be considered substantial, the modifications shall be reviewed by the Design Review Committee.
4. Any future expansion in area or in the nature and scope of work approved by Design Review No. 4799-15 and Major Site Plan Review No. 1054-21 shall require new or amended applications.
5. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceedings and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
6. The applicant, managers, successors, and all future assigns shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, including all City regulations. Violation of any of those laws in connection with the use will be cause for revocation of this permit.
7. Building permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Public Works Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits may be cause for revocation of this entitlement.
8. All structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code - Chapter 15.52 (Building Security Standards), which relates to hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc. (Ord. 7-79). Approved structural drawings shall include sections of the security code that apply.

Specifications, details, or security notes may be used to convey the compliance.

9. In conjunction with construction, all activity will be limited to the hours between 7 a.m. and 8 p.m. Monday through Saturday. No construction activity will be permitted on Sundays and federal holidays.
10. The applicant/developer shall be aware that all work within the public right-of-way requires the issuance of an encroachment permit. Such work includes, but is not limited to, work on the sidewalk, driveway construction, and utility laterals.
11. These conditions shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Division for the plan check process.
12. If not utilized, project approval expires twenty-four months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060. The Planning entitlements expire unless building permits are pulled within two years of the original approval.
13. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director that all mechanical and air conditioning equipment shall be shielded and screened from view from adjacent streets and properties. The screening shall be integrated architecturally with the building.
14. Any graffiti shall be removed within 72 hours from the time the City of Orange Notice of Violation is received by the applicant/property owner.
15. Any new lighting on the premise shall be installed in such a way to direct, control, and screen the lighting to prevent off site light spillage onto adjoining properties and shall not be a nuisance to any point beyond the exterior boundaries of the property.
16. The days and hours of operation of the proposed multi-purpose service building shall be:

Saturdays:	9:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m.
Sundays	4:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m.

Modifications to the days and hours of operation may be approved by the Community Development Director or designee.

17. Use of the proposed multi-purpose service building shall not occur at the same time as church Liturgy services, shall be limited to congregant use, and shall not be open to the public.
18. Prior to building permit issuance, plans shall be revised to show new street trees to be replanted in existing tree wells subject to Public Works Department review and approval.
19. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall prepare a final landscaping and irrigation

plan consistent with the grading plans, site plans, and the conceptual landscaping plan as proposed for the project, for the review and approval of the Community Development Director or designee.

20. Prior to building permit issuance, final landscaping plans for the project shall be designed to comply with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Guidelines as described in Section IX et al of the City of Orange Landscape Standards and Specifications. Prior to certificate of occupancy, all landscaping improvements shall be completed according to the approved plans and the project landscape architect shall submit documentation certifying compliance with this requirement for review and approval by the Community Development Director or designee in coordination with the Public Works Director or designee.
21. Landscape maintenance shall be performed in such a manner as to allow all trees to retain their full canopy height for screening and full canopy breadth for shade at point of maturity, except as required for public safety purposes.
22. Prior to building permit issuance, the final landscape plan shall include a note that a fully automated irrigation system will be provided.
23. Prior to building permit issuance, City required irrigation and landscape inspection notes, in accordance with the City of Orange Landscape Standards and Specifications, shall be placed on the final landscape plan, to the satisfaction of the Community Services Director or designee in coordination with the Public Works Director or designee.
24. All landscape areas shall be maintained in a neat and healthy condition. Should the plant material die, the property owner/operator shall replace it with similar plant material within one month.
25. Prior to building permit issuance, landscape plans shall include landscape area calculations needed for State landscape water use reporting.

13. ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 Vicinity Map
- Attachment 2 Applicant's Letter of Explanation
- Attachment 3 Planning Commission Resolution No. PC 23-09
- Attachment 4 Development Standards Reference Table
- Attachment 5 Project Plans
- Attachment 6 Color and Materials Board